Snake News or Fake News?

The Game Show
Tara Cataldo
Science Collections Coordinator
Marston Science Library
University of Florida
Researching Students’ Information Choices (RSIC): Determining Identity and Judging Credibility in Digital Spaces

• 4 Years
• 12 Researchers
• 8 Advisory panel members
• 175 students
• 4 Google Simulations
• 1,457,000 hours of coding
  (just kidding)
Welcome
Vocabulary: Containers

- Book
- Blog
- Conference proceeding
- Journal
- Preprint
- News
- Magazine
- Website
Vocabulary: SERPs

Search
Engine
Result
Pages
Higher education students

- 30 Community College Students
- 30 Undergraduate Students
- 30 Graduate Students
snake news
or
fake news?
Samuel Putnam, 
Engineering Librarian 
Marston Science Library 
University of Florida
Amy Buhler, 
Engineering Librarian 
Marston Science Library 
University of Florida
1. Two contestants will be asked a question based on the data from RSIC.

2. Each contestant will be asked to guess in the form of a percentage.

3. The contestant with the closest guess to the correct percentage wins a point!
Round 1

News, Can You Use?
What percentage of students found an AP story on YouTube helpful?
BURMESE PYTHONS KILLING WILDLIFE IN EVERGLADES - YouTube
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=8X99JwZ4iO0
Jul 31, 2015 – Uploaded by AP Archive
LEAD IN Burmese pythons are suspected of being responsible for wiping out large numbers of raccoons ...
32%
Tell Us More…

- ALL CAPS!!!
  - 12% of students remarked on this
  - “YouTube. I don't know why all caps stuff sounds like a really old man at a computer yelling at me [laughter], and I'm not going to click it [laughter]”
Tell Us More…

- Video format a turn-off?
  - 50/50 split between positive and negative judgements related to video format
  - “I may look at the YouTube thing just to see the video, just because they're quick and easy to just see and visualize.”
  - “Burmese Pythons Killing Wildlife in Everglades. It's a YouTube video, so I definitely can't use that. Though it would be nice to watch. But it's still nothing I can actually use in a paper.”
What percentage of students that found an NPR interview helpful also found it citable?
Florida’s Python Problem: Snakes Reshape The Everglades

Jan 14, 2013 – University of Florida professor Frank Mazzotti talks about the threat they present to the ecosystem of the Everglades. CELESTE HEADLEE ...

CELESTE HEADLEE, HOST:

But in Florida, there’s a python problem. Experts estimate there could be as
Tell Us More…

- Interview
  - 36% of students mentioned that this was an interview
  - “The second one, Florida's Python Problem. This, I'm not even going to bother with this because this is an NPR-- this is like an interview, and there might be one or two things helpful, but out of the 20 sites that I've picked, I'm sure I can find better. So I'm going to say no to this.”
Tell Us More…

- Expertise
  - Only 7% of students mentioned the expertise of the professor being interviewed
  - “So, NPR, yes, because they have a professor that is knowledgeable in the field. It would be easy to cite it because it was a publication, an interview.”
Question 3

Round 1

What percentage of our students said a NYT article was not credible by giving it a 1 on a 5-point Likert scale?
Burmeses pythons, often released into the wild by pet owners, have infested the Florida Everglades and created a reptilian nightmare in the ecosystem. ... The United States is awash in invasive species exacting a heavy toll on native wildlife and vegetation. ...
6%
Tell Us More…

- NYT’s average credibility score was 3.6 out of 5
  - “Well, New York Times has some prestige. And I think that the facts that they may include are trustworthy. Whatever the opinion or the bias is if I find a fact there or some information regarding things that happened, I know that I'll be able to trust, rather than a blog or something like that or a YouTube video.”
  - **Student**: “New York Times, I think, is highly credible also. They generally fact check.”
    - **Facilitator**: “Yeah. But you gave it a four?”
    - **Student**: “Yeah, just because it is an article for viewers, so it's not a scientific article. It can still have biases and things like that.”
Round 2

Say My Name, Say My Name
What percentage of students said that a SpringerLink ebook was a book?
Invasive Predators: a synthesis of the past, present, and future

William C. Pitt, Gary W. Witmer
48%
Tell Us More…

- Does it stack up to the Google Book?
  - 100% labeled Google book as book
  - A study entitled “Positively Perplexing E-Books” that was presented here at Charleston found that 28% labeled Springer an ebook (as opposed to 76% for Google book)
Tell Us More…

- Springer = Journal
  - 39% of students thought it was journal
  - “Springer, another journal. Yeah. Well, I mean, it's a published book from Springer, so I guess that would be considered a journal. I mean, it's a book, though, so I don't know. I don't know.”
What percentage of students gave a JSTOR magazine article a credibility score of 4 or 5 on a 5-point Likert scale?
82%
Tell Us More…

● Brand Matters

○ 33% of students recognized JSTOR

○ “I'd give this one a five because we use it a lot in school [laughter].”

○ “This seems a little more pop science-ey. So even though it's published by JSTOR, I’d give it a four. I mean, I'm sure the information's credible, but not to the level of certain other publications.”
What percentage of students found a Nature.com press release helpful?

Mar 26, 2015 – Invasive pythons have been blamed for the decline of many mammals in a protected area in Florida. Now, Robert McCleery of the University of ....
Tell Us More…

- Brand Matters
  - 20% of students recognized Nature
  - “Oh, Nature is good. Nature is one of the premier science article publishers. They are what most scientists aspire to. So let's see if they have any good information. And not really. I'm not very impressed. I will not cite this even though I think the source is-- I hold this source in high regard, but I wouldn't cite it.”
  - “I picked the nature.com one because I like the show Nature.”
Round 3
Don’t Contain Me, Bro
What percentage of students recognized that a JSTOR magazine article was contained in a magazine?
Pythons squeeze out local species in South Florida

Janet Raloff
Science News
Vol. 181, No. 4 (FEBRUARY 25, 2012), pp. 5-6

Published by: Society for Science & the Public
Stable URL: http://www.jstor.org/stable/41480713
Page Count: 2

Tell Us More…

- Aggregators can be confusing

- JSTOR = Journal. 44% of students said it was a journal.
  - “This is JSTOR, so you know that's a journal.”
  - “JSTOR is mostly journals, I think. Yeah.”
  - “journal for JSTOR”
  - “This is just for-- I thought [inaudible] something. The science news. Oh, I think JSTOR the journal aggregator, so let's go with that.”
Question 2

What percentage of students recognized a NYT blog post as a blog?
Emma Marris: In Defense of Everglades Pythons

78%
Tell Us More…

● What’s in the URL?
  ○ 27% of students attended to URL
  ○ “I just see the URL link, it contains blogs. So it's a blog.”
  ○ “This one's definitely a blog because there's a blog in the link”
  ○ “It says blogs. It says a blog in the URL. Blog's right there.”

● Compare this to a blog with no URL indicator (only 20% labeled a blog)
Question 3

What percentage of students recognized that a *Journal of Herpetology* article on BioOne was contained in a journal?
Habitat Selection by the Invasive Species Burmese Python in Southern Florida

Abstract
Burmese Pythons (Python bivittatus) are large generalist predators that have
...
92%
Tell Us More…

- Most correctly identified journal
  - Having “journal” in the title (and URL) helps identification
  - **Student:** “And that is a journal.”
  - **Facilitator:** “So yeah, what's leading you to select journal for that one?”
  - **Student:** “The URL says, ‘Journal of Herpetology.’”
Tell Us More…

- Least correctly identified journal
  - *Integrative Zoology* from Wiley was only identified as a journal by 63% (24% said it was a book).
  - Wiley = Book
  - “Ecological correlates of invasion impact, okay. So Wiley Online Library, so they have a book.”
Round 4

SERPs Up, Dudes
What percentage of students made their helpful judgements using only the information found in the SERPs?
Everglades Python Challenge: the hunt for an invasive species
Everglades Python Challenge: the hunt for an invasive species. January 18, 2016 by Captain Mitch. burmese python. Over the weekend, the Florida Fish and ...

Burmese pythons in Florida - Wikipedia, the free encyclopedia
Burmese pythons in Florida. A Burmese python captured in the Everglades National Park, where the invasive snakes have established a large breeding population. Burmese pythons (Python bivittatus) are native to Southeast Asia.

Burmese Pythons: Research – National Park Service
https://www.nps.gov/.../burmesepythonresearch.htm National Park Service
The invasive population of Burmese pythons in the Florida Everglades, therefore, requires resource managers to rely upon original scientific research and novel ...

Florida’s Python Problem: Snakes Reshape The Everglades : NPR
www.npr.org/2013/01/.../floridas-python-problem-snakes-reshape-the-everglades NPR
Jan 14, 2013 – University of Florida professor Frank Mazzotti talks about the threat they present to the ecosystem of the Everglades. CELESTE HEADLEE ...

Burmese Pythons Are Taking Over the Everglades | TIME
www.time.com/5732720/burmese-pythons-take-over-everglades/ TIME
10%
Tell Us More…

- Worst fear come true!
- K-12 students had an even larger number
  - 22% did not leave the SERPs
What percentage of students that found a Wikipedia article helpful also found it citable?
Burmese pythons in Florida. A Burmese python captured in the Everglades National Park, where the invasive snakes have established a large breeding population. Burmese pythons (Python bivittatus) are native to Southeast Asia.
13%
Tell Us More…

- 69% of students found the Wikipedia article helpful

- Wikipedia Shaming
  - “Wikipedia is usually right. I wouldn't cite it, but … it's usually written by people that know what they're talking about.”
  - “I hate that it's shamed, that you shouldn't use it because it’s-- I don’t know…And in my generation, everything--I feel like they’re like, “They’re going to go in there.”…I’ve actually found it to be really concise and kind of like a little nugget of information that allows me to explore further. And poor Wikipedia, and I'm upset that people are mean about it [laughter].”
What percentage of students selected the National Park Service page as helpful?
Burmese Pythons: Research

Nowhere else on the planet has such a large constrictor been introduced and established in a foreign locale as a result of the exotic pet trade. The invasive population of Burmese pythons in the Florida Everglades, therefore, requires resource managers to rely upon original scientific research and novel strategies to guide control efforts. Follow the links below to access additional resources on lessons learned and studies currently underway.
Tell Us More…

- Students trust the government
  - 56% of students attended to .gov during the simulation
  - “NPS. I was unsure about this one. I'm not sure if it's considered academic or not. I'm going to go with yes just because it says .gov.”
Final Round

Complete the Juicy Quote

Twayna Mayne [CC BY 2.0 (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/2.0)]
“What’s a ___________?”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Word Bank</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Blog</td>
<td>Preprint</td>
<td>Journal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magazine</td>
<td>Book</td>
<td>Conference Proceeding</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“What’s a ________ Preprint ________ ?”
– Just About Everyone
"So __________, I would not choose. Well, I'm lying. I would choose [it]."
"So Wikipedia, I would not choose. Well, I'm lying. I would choose [it]."

- Graduate Student
“I want to look at this one first because it's a dot ____. Just because I trust those or I'm told to trust them [laughter].
“I want to look at this one first because it's a dot.gov. Just because I trust those or I'm told to trust them [laughter].

- Undergraduate Student
“Teachers don't usually like __________ as one of your sources.”

Word Bank:

<p>| | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>text</td>
<td>video</td>
<td>audio</td>
<td>data</td>
<td>images</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“Teachers don't usually like Video as one of your sources.”

- Community College Student
“So if it's a library, it's probably from a ________, and ________s are usually true.”

Word Bank

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Blog</th>
<th>Preprint</th>
<th>Journal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Magazine</td>
<td>Book</td>
<td>Conference Proceeding</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“So if it's a library, it's probably from a ___book___, and ___books___ are usually true.”

- Community College Student
What percentage of students recognized PeerJ as a preprint?
Potential problems of removing one invasive species at a time:

https://peerj.com/preprints/1651/

by SA Ballari – 2016

Jan 15, 2016 – Potential problems of removing one invasive species at a time: … PeerJ PrePrints 4:e1651v11 https://doi.org/10.7287/peerj.preprints.1651v1

Sebastián A Ballari¹, Sara E Kuebbing², Martin A Nuñez³

January 15, 2016

A peer-reviewed article of this Preprint also exists
Thank you ssssssooo much!

Tara Cataldo ttobin@ufl.edu
Sam Putnam srputnam@ufl.edu
Amy Buhler abuhler@ufl.edu
Chris Cyr cyrc@oclc.org

Link to Slides
https://bit.ly/2WN01dz

http://guides.uflib.ufl.edu/RSIC
@RSICstudy #containercollapse

RSIC@uflib.ufl.edu

This project was made possible in part by the Institute of Museum and Library Services grant number LG-81-15-0155