The OCLC cataloging community meeting

2 FEBRUARY 2024
David Whitehair
Director, Metadata & Digital Services
OCLC

Welcome
Today’s schedule

• Welcome
• Diversity, equity, and inclusion
• Open questions
Today’s schedule

• Welcome
• Diversity, equity, and inclusion
• Open questions

• OCLC update
• Open questions
• Closing
Housekeeping…

Webex

• If your computer audio is not working, please dial-in by phone
  – Dial-in information has been posted in Chat

• To submit questions, use Chat and send to “Everyone”
  – Note: Your question will be visible to others attending this session
Housekeeping…

Webex

• If your computer audio is not working, please dial in by phone
  – Dial-in information has been posted in Chat
• To submit questions, use Chat and send to “Everyone”
  – Note: Your question will be visible to others attending this session

Post-event

• OCLC will make available:
  – Recordings of each session
  – Slides
  – Cited links list
• Notifications:
  – Registrants will receive an email via Webex
  – OCLC will post links to content in the Cataloging & Metadata community
Diversity, equity, and inclusion

Cynthia Whitacre
Senior Metadata Operations Manager, Metadata Engagement
OCLC
Diversity, equity, and inclusion

Harmful Language in Transcribed Titles: A Case Study

Treshani Perera, University of Kentucky Libraries

“Use for works that exhibit hostility toward or bias against”: Expanding and revising the Controlled Vocabulary for Rare Materials Cataloging

Sarah Hoover, University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill
Treshani Perera
Head of Fine Arts Library Technical Services
University of Kentucky Libraries
Harmful Language in Transcribed Titles: A Case Study

Treshani Perera
In previous presentations:

Have been exploring this topic since 2021: first public acknowledgement and a possible solution shared during the ARSC webinar.

Example provided in later presentations:
(reactive approach)
- transcribe the title as found
- add “[content warning]” at the end
- add an appropriate note in MARC 500
- local catalog record only

Catalog record for a sound recording with racist language in the title:

245 00 $a Dixie ; $bRun n**** run [content warning]
500 $a Racial slur in title is transcribed from label. Nineteenth and twentieth-century music reflect both the racial stereotypes and social prejudices of the era. Users should be aware that racial slurs may be found in the sound recording.
Feedback from others:

520 4_ [Content advice note]
- not for transcribed metadata; note applies to contents of item

A local note (coded in 500 or 590, or another local field)

A general harmful language statement in place of an item-level note
- The Cataloging Lab: List of Statements on Bias in Library and Archives Description
Case Study: Charles Faber Collection

Sound recording collection containing 78 rpm discs - covering popular music from the early 20th century (mostly vocal music, some instrumental music).

Fall 2023: metadata remediation project to proactively address offensive/outdated language in transcribed fields.

Goal: add appropriate item-level content warning notes and review subjects assigned - remediation work in OCLC records and re-export into local catalog.
Project planning

Started with a collection audit: 1748 records

Title level analysis: closely examine transcribed data + subject terms

Metadata remediation in OCLC records: review of LCSH and reassignment, as appropriate

Transcribed data in titles: more complicated (more on this later)
Metadata remediation: Review of LCSH

Before:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LCSH</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ethnic wit and humor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Popular music--1901-1910</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

During review:

- identify missing subject headings to add (e.g. Monologues with music, Minstrel shows)
- remove incorrect headings (e.g. Ethnic wit and humor)

During review:

- identify missing subject headings to add (e.g. Monologues with music, Minstrel shows)
- remove incorrect headings (e.g. Ethnic wit and humor)

After:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LCSH</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Popular music--1901-1910</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monologues with music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$3 Darktown poets $a Minstrel shows</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

LCSH: Ethnic wit and humor

Popular music--1901-1910

Monologues with music

$3 Darktown poets $a Minstrel shows
Metadata remediation: Questionable title

Before:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>028</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>00</th>
<th>142002</th>
<th>+b Columbia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>028</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>00</td>
<td>142003</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>028</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>00</td>
<td>15079-D</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>049</td>
<td>KUKK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

899 | +b |

049 | KUKK |

240 | 0 | Betsy Brown, +b Crazy coon |

241 | 1 | +b Side B: a Crazy coon |

260 | +b Columbia. |

336 | performed music: +b prem +2 raccoon |

337 | audio +b s +2 raccoon |

338 | audio disc +b sd +2 raccoon |

356 | Slippery Hill database: “Offensive lyrics”) |

15079-D (14203) (mat) 142002 (mat) |

500 | John Edwards Memorial Collection. |

506 | Country music: To 1951 |

520 | 4 | $3 Crazy coon $a Contains racist language |

During review:

- external research (Georgia Songsters Liner notes: “‘I don’t love nobody’ with the rarely heard verses”;
- Slippery Hill database: “Offensive lyrics”)

- recording contains the N-word in verses
- contents advice note

After:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>028</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>00</th>
<th>142002</th>
<th>+b Columbia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>028</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>00</td>
<td>142003</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>028</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>00</td>
<td>15079-D</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>049</td>
<td>KUKK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

899 | +b |

049 | KUKK |

240 | 0 | Betsy Brown, +b Crazy coon |

241 | 1 | +b Side B: a Crazy coon |

260 | +b Columbia. |

336 | performed music: +b prem +2 raccoon |

337 | audio +b s +2 raccoon |

338 | audio disc +b sd +2 raccoon |

356 | Slippery Hill database: “Offensive lyrics”) |

15079-D (14203) (mat) 142002 (mat) |

500 | John Edwards Memorial Collection. |

506 | Country music: To 1951 |

520 | 4 | $3 Crazy coon $a Contains racist language |

520 4_ $3 Crazy coon $a Contains racist language
Harmful language in transcribed data: Titles

Archives for Black Lives in Philadelphia (2020). Anti-racist Description Resources

- Handling Racist Folder Titles and Creator-Sourced Description (p. 8)
  “Consider your audience and the potential for harm when making decisions about whether to preserve problematic creator-supplied language. In most cases, preserve but contextualize creator-sourced original description when racism is an important context for understanding records.”
Harmful language in transcribed data: Racist language in titles

Before:

500 Racial slur in title is transcribed from label. Nineteenth and twentieth-century music reflect both the racial stereotypes and social prejudices of the era. Users should be aware that racial slurs are repeatedly heard in the sound recording.

After:

500 Racial slur in title is transcribed from label. Nineteenth and twentieth-century music reflect both the racial stereotypes and social prejudices of the era. Users should be aware that racial slurs are repeatedly heard in the sound recording.
NAME: Adding Subfield $i to Field 245 in the MARC 21 Bibliographic Format (Harmful Language Advisory)

DESCRIPTION: Use of subfield $i to indicate the source of a transcribed title when that title contains harmful language - title is from a source not readily apparent to general users.

If implemented: (previous example)
245 00 $a Dixie : $b Run n***** run. $i Title transcribed from item
Cataloger’s Judgment

Problematic content? Add an appropriate content advice note (MARC 520 4_)

Consider CONTEXT for accurate subject analysis

Add contextual notes for harmful language in transcribed data

- Trans Metadata Collective: Metadata Best Practices for Trans and Gender Diverse Resources (November 2023)
  - “For sensitive language that is self-ascribed or directly in the material itself (e.g. title, caption, text), include a contextualizing statement and/or content warning in each place the material is described or may be encountered by users.” [p. 6]
Readings and Resources:

Treshani Perera: **Critical Cataloging: Identifying and Dismantling Bias in Description**

Dorothy Berry: **Descriptive Equity and Clarity around Blackface Minstrelsy in HTC Collections** (2021)

Trans Metadata Collective: **Metadata Best Practices for Trans and Gender Diverse Resources** (November 2023)

Archives for Black Lives in Philadelphia: **Anti-Racist Description Resources** (October 2020)
Thank you.

Treshani Perera
treshani.perera@uky.edu
Sarah Hoover
Special Collections Cataloger
University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill
"Use for works that exhibit hostility toward or bias against": Expanding and revising the Controlled Vocabulary for Rare Materials Cataloging

Sarah Hoover
Special Collections Cataloger
University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill

OCLC Cataloging Community Meeting
February 2, 2024
Overview

• Introduction to the RBMS CVRMC and its precursors
• History of the prejudicial materials terminology and the Prejudicial Materials Working Group
• New and revised terms in the Prejudicial works hierarchy
• Other areas of expansion and revision in RBMS CVRMC
• Ethical considerations and neutrality
RBMS Controlled Vocabulary for Rare Materials Cataloging (RBMS CVRMC)

- A genre/form vocabulary for special collections developed within the Rare Books and Manuscripts Section of ACRL/ALA
- Hosted at id.loc.gov by the Library of Congress Linked Data Service
Precursors to RBMS CVRMC

RBMS Controlled Vocabularies (2005-2018)

Separate thesauri:
• Binding Terms
• Genre Terms
• Paper Terms
• Printing & Publishing Evidence
• Provenance Evidence
• Type Evidence

List of Relationship designators
History of the prejudicial materials terminology

Genre Terms (1983)

- Literature of prejudice
  - UF: Hate literature
  - NT: Prejudice, Literature of
  - NT: Anti-Catholic literature
  - NT: Anti-clerical literature
  - NT: Anti-Masonic literature
  - NT: Anti-Semitic literature

UF = “used for”
NT = “narrower term”
History of the prejudicial materials terminology

Genre Terms (1983)

Genre Terms (1991) 2nd edition

**Literature of prejudice**

- **UF** Hate literature
- Prejudice, Literature of
- Anti-Catholic literature
- Anti-clerical literature
- Anti-Masonic literature
- Anti-Semitic literature

**UF** = “used for”

**BT** = “broader term”

**NT** = “narrower term”
### History of the prejudicial materials terminology

#### Genre Terms (1983)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Literature of prejudice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>UF</strong> Hate literature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>NT</strong> Anti-Catholic literature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>NT</strong> Anti-Masonic literature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>NT</strong> Anti-Semitic literature</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Genre Terms (1991) 2nd edition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Literature of prejudice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>UF</strong> Hate literature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>BT</strong> Prejudice, Literature of [Political works]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>NT</strong> Anti-Catholic literature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>NT</strong> Anti-Communist literature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>NT</strong> Anti-Homosexual literature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>NT</strong> Anti-Immigrant literature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>NT</strong> Anti-Masonic literature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>NT</strong> Anti-Semitic literature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>NT</strong> White supremacist literature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>NT</strong> Xenophobic literature</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**UF** = “used for”
**BT** = “broader term”
**NT** = “narrower term”

#### RBMS Controlled Vocabularies (2005-2018)

**Literature of prejudice**

**Scope Note**
Use for literature that expresses a negative sentiment toward a particular group of society, especially for reasons based on religion, race, gender, creed, or national origin.

**Used For**
- Hate literature

**Broader Term**
- Political works

**Narrower Term**
- Anti-Catholic literature
- Anti-Communist literature
- Anti-Homosexual literature
- Anti-Immigrant literature
- Anti-Masonic literature
- Anti-Semitic literature
- White supremacist literature
- Xenophobic literature
Prejudicial Materials Working Group: Impetus

- Practically: “Literature” terms are not appropriate for non-literary resources
  - Visual resources
  - Music

- Contextually: Broader environmental factors
  - Social unrest in response to systemic racism and racially motivated violence
  - Newly invigorated conversations around racism, privilege, and white supremacy
Prejudicial Materials Working Group: Charge

- Review, revise, and generate new terminology useful for indexing works that are prejudicial in nature, or that are the byproduct of prejudicial or outright hateful systems and ideologies

- Critically review, revise, and expand the structure of this area of the vocabulary
Prejudicial Materials Working Group: Timeline

- Begin work, August 2020
- End of phase 1 work, July 2022
- Phase 2 preparation for review begins, August 2022
- CVEG review of term proposals, February-March 2023
- Public review phase, April-May 2023
- Committee discussion of feedback, June-December 2023
- Updates to id.loc.gov, forthcoming
Prejudicial Materials Working Group: Goals

- Facilitate the study of oppression
- Mitigate further harm or misunderstanding
- Serve as content warning
- Avoid contributing to harm
- Avoid masking harm
Prejudicial works hierarchy

Prejudicial works
**Ableist works**
**Anti-Asian works**
**Anti-Chinese works**
**Anti-Indian works**
**Anti-Japanese works**
**Anti-Pakistani works**
**Anti-Black works**
Blackface minstrel jokes
Blackface minstrel songs
Anti-Catholic works
Anti-clerical works
Anti-communist works
Anti-immigrant works
**Anti-Indigenous works**
Anti-Jewish works

**Anti-Latin American works**
**Anti-Mexican works**
**Anti-LGBTQ+ works**
Homophobic works
**Transphobic works**
Anti-Masonic works
**Anti-Muslim works**
**Fascist works**
**Nazi works**
**Misogynistic works**
**Racist works**
**Racist caricatures**
White supremacist works
Xenophobic works

** denotes new terms
Prejudicial works hierarchy

**Prejudicial works:** Use for works that exhibit hostility toward or bias against a particular group or groups of people based on religion, race, ethnicity, gender, sexuality, ability, creed, national origin, etc. For works that express hatred or advocate harm toward a particular group of people, use: Hate works.

*Previous term:*

**Literature of prejudice**

Scope Note
Use for literature that expresses a negative sentiment toward a particular group of society, especially for reasons based on religion, race, gender, creed, or national origin.

Used For
*Hate literature*
Prejudicial works hierarchy

**Xenophobic works**: Use for works that exhibit hostility toward or bias against the people, customs, or cultures of countries other than that of the creator. For works that exhibit hostility or bias based on a specific national origin, see other narrower terms of Prejudicial works.

**Racist works**: Use for works that exhibit hostility toward or bias against peoples or cultures racialized as other by the dominant group or culture of a specific place or time. For works that exhibit hostility or bias based on a specific race, ethnicity, or national origin, see other narrower terms of Prejudicial works.
Prejudicial works hierarchy

Anti-Asian works
  - Anti-Chinese works
  - Anti-Indian works
  - Anti-Japanese works
  - Anti-Pakistani works

Anti-Black works
  - Blackface minstrel jokes
  - Blackface minstrel songs

Anti-Indigenous works

Anti-Latin American works
  - Anti-Mexican works

Terms are not meant to be exhaustive but to provide a scaffold for the future. We encourage the community to propose additional terms to further expand this section of the thesaurus.
Prejudicial works hierarchy

Previous terms:

**Minstrel jokes**
Scope Note
Use for collections of jokes made by blackface comedians of the 19th- and early 20th-century United States.
Broader Term
Humorous works (Gathering term; do not assign)

**Minstrel songs**
Scope Note
Use for songs traditionally performed by blackface entertainers, primarily in the 19th and early 20th centuries.
Broader Term
Songs

**Blackface minstrel jokes**

Citation: Berry, Dorothy. “Descriptive Equity and Clarity around Blackface Minstrelsy in HTC Collections.” August 6, 2021. https://www.dorothy-berry.com/minstrel-description

SN = “scope note”
BT = “broader term”
RT = “related term”
Prejudicial works hierarchy

**Anti-LGBTQ+ works**: Use for works that exhibit hostility toward or bias against people who identify with sexual or gender identities that are not heterosexual or cisgender.

**Homophobic works**: Use for works that exhibit hostility toward or bias against gay, lesbian, bisexual, or otherwise non-heterosexual individuals and communities.

**Transphobic works**: Use for works that exhibit hostility toward or bias against transgender and gender diverse individuals or groups, i.e., people or groups of people whose gender identity and/or gender expression differs from that which is typically associated with the sex they were assigned at birth in the context of the society in which they live.
Prejudicial works hierarchy

**Anti-Catholic works:** Use for works that exhibit hostility toward or bias against Catholic people or Catholicism.

**Anti-clerical works:** Use for works that oppose religious institutional power and influence in civic life, and which may exhibit hostility toward or bias against members of the clergy or religious leaders.

**Anti-Jewish works:** Use for works that exhibit hostility toward or bias against Jewish people, Judaism, or proponents or practitioners of Judaism. Do not use for works exclusively expressing criticism of or disagreement with the Israeli government or its policies.

**Anti-Muslim works:** Use for works that exhibit hostility toward or bias against Muslim people, Islam, or proponents or practitioners of Islam.
Other areas of revision: Humorous works

<Humorous works>: Encompasses works produced with the intention of being amusing, including works that criticize, demean, or mock.

Narrower Terms
- Burlesques
- Caricatures
- Cartoons
- Comedies
- Comic histories
- Epigrams
- Fabliaux
- Facetiae
- Jestbooks
- Limericks
- Nonsense verse
- Parodies
- Pastiches
- Satires
Other areas of expansion and revision: Colonialism

**Exploration literature**: Use for literary works, including primary accounts, that describe voyages to or exploration of areas unknown to the explorers, usually undertaken with the purported intent of gathering information. They frequently include descriptions of Indigenous peoples, resources, geography, etc.

**Colonialist works**: Use for works dating from approximately 1500 or later expressing the strategies, policies, and attitudes advocated by colonizing powers and settlers to subjugate or exploit peoples, geographic regions, and resources.

---

**Title**: Come and see the fine strip of country in the big 5 counties: the Aberdeen land district, South Dakota, where there are bargains in excellent deeded lands that can be bought, and 501,330 acres of free government land open for settlement to the home seeker under the homestead laws.

**Publication**: Aberdeen [South Dakota] : Daily News Print, [1893]

**Physical Description**: 1 folded sheet (4 panels); 16 x 32 cm folded to 16 x 8 cm
Other areas of expansion: Enslavement

**Bills of sale for enslaved persons:** Use for documents attesting to the transfer of ownership of persons whose body and labors are owned in involuntary bondage by another person or organization.

**Freedom papers:** Use for formal instruments attesting to the free status of an individual or individuals.

**Manumission documents:** Use for formal instruments attesting to the emancipation of individuals who were previously enslaved.

**Leases for the rental of enslaved persons:** Use for contracts between enslavers and lessees in which the lessee rents the body and labor of a person held in involuntary bondage.

**Relationship designators:**

- **enslaved person:** Use for a person whose body and labors are owned in involuntary bondage by another person or organization. When used in a resource description, use with documents/instruments/receipts of enslavement (e.g., bills of enslavement).

- **enslaver:** Use for a person or organization who holds another person in involuntary bondage. When used in a resource description, use with documents/instruments/receipts of enslavement (e.g., bills of enslavement).
Other areas of revision: Enslavement

**Enslaved people's narratives**

SN = “scope note”
UF = “used for”
BT = “broader term”
Ethical considerations

• Warrant in vocabulary building
  o The thesaurus has traditionally used literary warrant as the primary form of warrant
    – Who does this leave out?
    – How does this repeat the language of the oppressor?
  o This work shifted to more reliance on user and organizational warrant
    – Seeking how groups of people self-describe
    – Recognizing that preferred terminology changes quickly

• Implications of picking a single “preferred” form for a term with other forms as “variants”
Neutrality in cataloging

• Presenting materials without adequate description of offensive content is actively harmful

• Surfacing this content contributes to accurate bibliographic description

• Neutrality in cataloging is a false notion and the privilege to do nothing
Final thoughts

These terms can be used beyond a special collections context.

Look for the updated terms to be available in id.loc.gov soon!

Propose additional terms here: http://id.loc.gov/vocabulary/rbmscv.html
Prejudicial Materials Working Group

Liz Adams
Erin Blake
Jennifer Bradshaw
Jeremy Brett
Brenna Bychowski (ex-officio, 2020-2023)
Alison Clemens
Maren Cornett
Jessica Grzegorski

Jose Guerrero (chair, 2023-current)
Ryan Hildebrand (chair, 2020-2022)
Sarah Hoover (chair, 2022-2023)
Francis Lapka
Francesca Marini
Kathleen Siebert Medicus
Lauren Reno (ex-officio, 2020-2023)
Staci Ross

Italics denote former group members
Sarah Hoover sehoover@email.unc.edu

RBMS Controlled Vocabulary for Rare Materials Cataloging
http://ld.loc.gov/vocabulary/rbmscv.html

Thank you!
Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion

Please enter questions in chat and send to everyone
OCLC cataloging community meeting
2 February 2024

Break
The OCLC cataloging community meeting

2 FEBRUARY 2024